DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 348 704 CS 507 896

AUTHOR Berens, Eileen; Nance, Teresa A.
TITLE Is What We Have, What We Want?: A Critical Review of Selected Basic Course Textbooks.
PUB DATE 2 Nov 92
NOTE 25p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Speech Communication Association (77th, Atlanta, GA, October 31-November 3, 1991).
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS Comparative Analysis; Content Analysis; Higher Education; Introductory Courses; *Public Speaking; Speech Instruction; *Textbook Content; Textbook Evaluation; Textbook Research; *Textbooks
IDENTIFIERS Speech Communication Education

ABSTRACT

A two-stage study was designed to offer a comprehensive analysis of current basic public speaking textbooks. The first stage involved a comprehensive classification, enumeration, and comparison of the substance of six textbooks identified by publishers as leading competitors on the public speaking market. Results from the first stage formed the basis of the framework for the second stage in the development of criteria to be applied to the broad areas of theory, instructional techniques, and communication technology. Results indicated that: (1) there is remarkable consistency in the topics covered in the textbooks, all of which show a clear pragmatic skills orientation; (2) theory presented in public speaking textbooks can best be described as traditional, with new communication theory often not integrated into the chapters; (3) despite differences in emphasis and arrangement, public speaking textbooks follow the same basic structural pattern they have for most of the 20th century; and (4) issues such as the impact of cultural diversity and media have not been integrated into the substance of the textbooks. Findings suggest that public speaking textbooks need to change, but that significant change will only occur when classroom teachers can articulate clearly what they want. (Four tables of data are included; 18 references and a list of textbooks evaluated are attached.) (RS)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED348704

IS WHAT WE HAVE, WHAT WE WANT?: A CRITICAL REVIEW OF SELECTED BASIC COURSE TEXTBOOKS

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

✓ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL IN **OTHER THAN PAPER COPY** HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Teresa Nance
Eileen Berens

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Eileen Berens and Teresa A. Nance
Communication Arts Department
Villanova University
Villanova, PA 19085

Paper Presented at the 1991 Speech Communication Association
Atlanta, Georgia
November 2, 1991

CS507896

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CRITICAL REVIEW OF SELECTED TEXTBOOKS

INTRODUCTION

Public speaking is a course most readily identified with our field. There are those who would trace the roots of contemporary public speaking courses back to the days of Plato and Aristotle. While deeply steeped in tradition, public speaking and other basic communication courses are becoming even more consequential today as educational reformers work to improve existing undergraduate education. Skill in communication, written and oral, is frequently listed as an appropriate topic for consideration across the college curriculum. Basic communication courses, especially those with a public speaking focus, seem as integral to the development of today's young scholars as they were in the days of Plato, Aristotle, Cicero and Quintilian.

Public speaking is not only well known by those outside of the field; it is certainly well known within the field as well. Large numbers of graduate students, instructors and other new faculty list public speaking as a course frequently taught. In the last of the Gibson et. al. surveys about the Basic Course, the authors found that the predominant orientation toward the basic course was public speaking (Gibson, Hanna and Leichty, 1990). Given its current visibility and viability, coupled with the prevailing atmosphere for educational reform, an examination of the public speaking course seems in order.

Rather than looking at the whole public speaking course, textbooks are the special interest of this paper. Public speaking textbooks and public speaking courses seem closely bound together. Wulff and Nyquist (1990) observed that instructors generally use textbooks in one of two ways: either to structure the course or as supplementary reading material to clarify and enrich the content of the course. With respect to the Basic Course, Katula (1990) noted that ". . .textbooks do set the agenda in the basic course in speech fundamentals even today. . . " (p.1)

Previous examinations of textbooks have tended to focus on the treatment of specific content areas such as conflict (Doolittle, 1977), or communication apprehension (Hinchcliff-Pelias, 1989). Most recently, questions have been raised regarding the accuracy of some information about persuasion presented in textbooks (Allen and Preiss, 1990). While each review lent some insight into one component of the public speaking textbook or another, collectively they did not provide a <u>comprehensive</u> overview of what current public speaking textbooks offer classroom teachers.

Consequently, it is the purpose of this paper to re-examine public speaking pedagogy through a critical review of leading public speaking textbooks. A content analysis will be used to examine six

leading public speaking textbooks. The results should produce an understanding of what each text uniquely provides to the classroom teacher and a detailed description of the current state of public speaking pedagogy.

This study was conducted in two stages. Stage I involved a comprehensive classification and enumeration of the substance of each textbook from page 1 to the end of the book (excluding the index and credits). The information gathered was then used for a comparative analysis to determine topical coverage, arrangement, and emphasis among the textbooks. This stage was directed by the following questions: What topics does this textbook cover? What concentration is accorded various topics? How are the topics arranged?

Results from Stage I formed the basis for the framework for Stage II in the development of criteria to be applied to the broad areas of theory, instructional techniques, and communication technology. This stage was directed by the following questions: Are current public speaking textbooks incorporating recent communication theory? Do current textbooks reflect modern instructional methods? The goal of this stage was to assess the relevancy of current textbooks for their audience - college students of the '90's whose professional careers will extend far into the 21st century.

This two-tiered study was designed to offer a comprehensive analysis of current textbooks by themselves. No attention was offered to peripheral materials, such as instructor's manuals, videos, computer testbanks, and other supplements. This was based on the assumption that students generally possess the textbook and usually lack access to the peripherals. A comparative evaluation of the textbooks is intended to provide public speaking course directors, textbook selection committees, instructors, and, indeed, the authors and publishers themselves some challenging areas for exploration.

Stage I Methods: The Description

Textbook Selection

The six texts selected for analysis were chosen because they were identified by publishers as leading competitors on the public speaking market. The books are: Public Speaking for Personal Success 2nd ed. by Hanna and Gibson, Principles and Types of Speech Communication 11 ed. by Gronbeck, McKerrow, Ehninger and Monroe; Principles of Speech Communication 10th ed by Gronbeck, Ehninger and Monroe The Art of Public Speaking 3rd ed by Lucas; Public Speaking 2nd ed. by Osborn and Osborn and The Challenge of Public Speaking 8th ed by Verderber.

Method of Evaluation

Each text was subjected to careful analysis. In order to answer the questions about coverage and concentration a list of thirty five topics was developed. The topics reflected a synthesis of all the content areas identified in the Table of Contents of the texts selected for review or areas identified by an author or authors in the preface of her/his text as significant.

The answer to the question about arrangement was gathered by comparing each of the textbooks Table of Contents to the others. (See Table 1) Also noted were any comments made about arrangement in the preface of the textbooks.

Coding Procedures

The six textbooks were divided between two coders. Each coder went through three texts recording (a) the location of the content area in the text and (b) the total number of pages afforded to the specific topic area.

Stage I Results

RQ1 What topics do textbooks cover?

A review of the topics covered by all the textbooks reveal the pragmatic skills orientation of these six leading texts. The list of topics could be read as a list of things to do. After finding out about communication in the initial chapters, for example, students learn to listen, study the audience, select a topic, find supporting materials and so on.

There is remarkable consistency in the topics covered. Of the content areas specified (excluding the miscellaneous and appendices categories) only eight topic areas, approximately 24%, are not addressed by each text. While some of the exceptions could be attributed to a special focus by the author(s) such as Hanna/Gibson's discussion of self-disclosure or Lucas and Osborn/Osborn's discussion of interviewing or Gronbeck et. al.'s discussion of rhetorical sensitivity, other exceptions are noteworthy.

In terms of content, Lucas and Gronbeck (brief) do not have a special section devoted to the First Speech. The inclusion of this topic area is a recent addition to public speaking texts and currently seems to be appearing in more texts. Gronbeck (brief) is the only text that does not have a section on library research. The authors embed a brief mention of research indices in a discussion of using magazines to gather material for a speech. Communication apprehension is covered (a bit) by all of the author's except Gronbeck et. al. It should be noted however, the authors deal with a similar issue but under the title of rhetorical sensitivity.

In terms of pedagogy the differences are minimal. Lucas, for example is the only author who does **not** make use of chapter previews while Verderber and Gronbeck (brief) are the only two authors who do **not** make use of quotations. All of the texts provide chapter summaries, questions and/or exercises as well as sample speeches and outlines.

In general, the books are more similar than they are different in terms of the topicscovered. It is reasonable then to conclude that these texts draw their uniqueness not from what topics are covered as how much coverage is provided and how the topic is developed by the author(s).

RQ2 What concentration is accorded various topics?

A look at the amount of space author(s) allocate to various topics indicates what they perceive to be significant. Gronbeck et. al. spend almost five times as much time developing students' orientation to the communication process than do their colleagues (10.2%) This unquestionably establishes a more theoretical approach to the public speaking course than Hanna/Gibson who offer a minimal discussion of communication process (1.6%)

Gronbeck et. al. also were quite different in the amount of time spent on audience adaptation (8.2%) and on audience analysis (2.6%). There is a simple explanation for this occurrence. This edition includes a new chapter on adapting speeches to audiences by using its well-known motivated sequence. While other authors may have placed this information in a persuasion chapter, these authors did not. Student speakers learn from this perspective why and how speeches can be adapted to audiences. Interestingly, on the other extreme, is Verderber using only 2.3% for **both** audience analysis and audience adaptation. A student could surmise that the orientation of the Verderber approach is speaker-centered.

Another obvious concentration difference exists in the area of Informative Speaking. While most authors are dedicating 4% to 5% of their content to the subject, Verderber commits over 16% of his content space to Informative Speaking. Separate chapters on the different types of Informative speaking alert students to the fact, that this author believes informative speaking to be the most prevalent type of speaking.

One final interesting concentration issue deals with the amount of space dedicated to helping the students learn the content. Included here are:

Previews, Quotations, Summaries, Questions/Exercises, Sample Speeches /Outlines and Appendices

The range of space used here is revealing. The authors cluster in two groups. In the first group Hanna/Gibson and Osborn/Osborn are very close using 27.5% and 27.4% of their space for pedagogy. Lucas follows close behind with 25.1%. In the second group,

Gronbeck et. al. employs 16.6% of his space for pedagogical items while Verderber and Gronbeck (brief) follow behind with almost identical space allotments of 15.7% and 15.6%. Further analysis of the space given to pedagogy shows that the authors who dedicated the most space to these concerns did so in the areas of Sample Speeches/Outlines and Questions and Exercises.

RQ3 How are the topics arranged?

Arranging material in a text presents authors with a difficult challenge. The arrangement must make sense in light of the approach the author has taken to teach public speaking. The arrangement must also be consistent with how public speaking courses are generally laid out. Authors must guess (or rely on publisher collected syllabi) at how most teachers want the information to flow within their courses. Some authors have acknowledged another approach: make each chapter a self-contained unit that can be utilized in other arrangements. (See Lucas p. vii and Osborn/Osborn p. xxi)

After reviewing the order of topic presentation (see Table 1), it became clear that on the matter of arrangement the textbooks are more similar than different. The major topic areas are placed in approximately the same section of each text. There is one interesting exception. Verderber calls his approach to public speaking, student-centered and thus has structured his text to get students up and talking quickly. All of the requisite background and how-to-do-it material are printed in the first 100 pages of the text. At this point, if all has gone well, students have enough of the basic information to begin to speak effectively. Consequently, while the topic "listening" occurs early on in most texts, for Verderber "listening" becomes a topic students read about after they have begun speechmaking. On the other hand while other texts deal with "language and delivery" toward the back of the book (Chapters 10, 11, or even 14), Verderber develops these issues in Chapters 5 & 6.

A composite arrangement of the topics reveals a course layout similar to most of the individual texts. The composite arrangement was compiled by simply averaging the chapter numbers and arranging them from high to low. The topics in composite order are:

> Process, (First Speech) Listening, Selecting Topic (Purpose), Audience Analysis and Adaptation, Supporting Materials, Organization/Outlining, (Introduction/Conclusions) Language, Delivery, Visual Aids, Informative Speaking, Persuasive Speaking, Argument, Special Occasion Speaking, (Small Group Communication)[1]

---

[1] The bracketed topics did not appear in all six texts.

Stage II Methods: The Evaluation

Based on the full content analysis and the descriptive data that resulted from Stage I, criteria were developed for a rigorous evaluation. The criteria were: the objectives of the textbook, instructional devices, the communication model, the theory/practice dichotomy, and the integration of new theory. Each textbook was examined based on these criteria and descriptive notes were made. Following this, these research questions were posed: 1. Are current public speaking textbook incorporating recent communication theory? 2. Do current textbooks reflect modern instructional methods? The descriptive information for the 3rd, 4th and 5th criteria were used to respond to the first question. The 1st and 2nd criteria were used as a basis for response to the second question.

Three chapters were selected for deep analysis: the introductory chapter because it includes textbook goals and communication models; and the informative and persuasive chapters because the last two course surveys (Gibson, et. al., 1990, 1985) rank these two content areas as the top topics receiving the greatest amount of time in basic speech courses.

The answer to Question 1 was gleaned in two ways. First, a careful analysis of the preview and/or introductory chapter was done in order to obtain the authors' own statements about the incorporation of new theory. (See Table 2) Secondly, reference notes were counted and the dates of referenced works contributing to the theoretical development of the chapter were noted. (See Table 3)

To answer Question 2, descriptive data about textbook objectives and instructional techniques were used to provide generalizable information. (See Table 2) Next, the three selected chapters were analyzed for instructional techniques in order to form a comparison. (See Table 4) Finally, earlier textbooks by Blair, Winans, and Monroe were examined for goals and instructional devices so that the old and the new textbooks could be compared in pedagogy.

Stage II Results

RQ1 Are current public speaking textbooks incorporating recent communication theory?

The role of theory in the public speaking course is a curious one. As Lucas (1990) notes, the typical public speaking course is not "preeminently" concerned with theory." Public speaking is most often considered a skills course. Given the time constraints of the academic calendar, there is simply not enough room in the syllabus to devote to extended discussions of rhetorical or

communication theory. And yet, the principles of effective public presentations are based on fundamental theories of the discipline. Teaching students the practice of public speaking without the theory is like teaching a small child to recite a difficult poem. Both the child and the student are learning behaviors in a vacuum. Neither has learned the reason for the behaviors and thus are not likely to retain the behaviors long after the rewards for performing the behaviors have ended.

There is also a sense that in order to provide academic legitimacy to the course, some theoretical groundwork needs to be provided to students. So in developing the focus of their courses, public speaking teachers face a dilemma: if too much time is devoted to skill-building and performance, then their course is not academic (and by unstated inference not challenging); if too much time is devoted to theory then the students don't get what they paid for--the ability to speak well in public. Obviously, teachers must reach a balance between theory and performance.

Public speaking textbooks also must balance theory and performance. Often the textbook authors make their position on the theory-performance question clear. Lucas (1990), for example, makes his point when he writes:

> The book continues to be informed by classical and contemporary theories of rhetoric but does not present theory for its own sake.

Osborn and Osborn (1991) describe their approach as an attempt:

> to offer the student both practical instruction in how to speak effectively in public and an introduction to the basic principles underlying effective communication.

Verderber (1991) developed a four-step method designed to give students all the basic theory in the first 100 pages of the text (designed as a "relatively 'fast read' and 'an easy learn'".) This frees student and teacher to devote the rest of their time to skill-building.

Gronbeck et. al (1988) in their brief edition write that their aim is to provide readers with "communication skills grounded in understanding, tied to a vocabulary and ingrained by guided practice."

Having dealt with the need to include theory, the issue for many textbook writers seems to be recency. All the authors, except one, mention their efforts to include new theory in the texts. Typical of their remarks are such comments as:

> Longevity comes to textbooks that look backward and forward. . .backward to this grounding in timeless

> principles of speech composition and forward to new ideas that keep them ahead of the field. This textbook has prided itself on the firmness of its intellectual base: traditional rhetorical principles and contemporary communication research. (Gronbeck et. al., preface)
>
> We draw from the past and present from the social sciences and the humanities in our effort to provide the most useful coverage of the elements of public speaking for the beginning speaker. (Osborn and Osborn, p. xiv)
>
> . . .made sure footnotes and references reflect current theory and research. (Lucas, vi)

Clearly, the intention of most of the authors is to provide readers with the most up-to-date theory and research possible. A look at key chapters reveals some interesting results.

A review of dates of the supporting research at the end of the selected chapters shows that not all authors and not all chapters are supported by the most recent research. A look across all of the chapters on process (See Table 3) demonstrates this point. Hanna and Gibson and Lucas reference materials **primarily** within the last ten years. While the Gronbeck texts reference substantially more material, the dates span thirty and seem to concentrate in the last twenty. (It should be noted that in the expanded Gronbeck text there are special inserts called Research Datelines which give students the opportunity to read about very recent thought in the field. The point should be made, however, that as insert material this recent theory tends to be apart from the body of the text. Unless students are sufficiently motivated they could easily not read the insert.) Osborn and Osborn and Verderber clearly rely on the most dated material with referrals to work dated 1932, 1949, 1951 and 1959.

Despite some of these dates the discussion of process in the texts frequently went beyond the specific material referenced. All six texts describe and discuss communication as a transactional process. Differences arise however in how the theory is represented as a model. Four of the models present the communication process abstractly using some combination of geometric shapes. Two of the models (Lucas and Gronbeck et. al.) use people to illustrate their notions of communication. One model (Verderber) refers to communication participants as senders and receivers, three refer to the participants first as source and receivers and then as speaker and listener in brackets, and two models (the same two who used people in their models) used only the terms speaker and listener to describe the participants in the model. While all the models seem to develop the notion of communication as transactional, it is fascinating to observe how the pictorial representations differ.

To the extent that a model represents in picture form a theoretical concept, the models using people rather than geometry to illustrate communication, emphasize communication as a humane rather than scientific study.

Interestingly, the research used to develop the various chapters on information and persuasion led each author to develop somewhat different approaches to learning how to give speeches.

A look first at the recency of the research used shows some real differences between the informative and persuasive chapters. The informative chapters used far fewer referenced materials. Most of the material referenced by all of the authors was published within the last ten years. Only the Verderber text used two references significantly older.

With one notable exception, all the books present informative speaking chapters that tend to describe the nature of informative speaking and then detail how ideas are organized, supported and the speech presented. Verderber is different because he has five chapters devoted to informative speaking. In addition to an overview chapter on the informative process, he has separate chapters on informative speeches that demonstrate, describe, define, and report. Despite the breadth of coverage on the subject, only three reference notes were given to support the theoretical work of the chapter. Clearly the orientation of this approach is on performance.

The persuasive chapters were supported by more referenced material. However, it was not all recent material. Lucas used the most material--32 references. Only 22% of those were more than ten years old. Gronbeck et. al used 25 references, 40% of which were more than ten years old. Osborn/Osborn and Hanna/Gibson used approximately the same number of references--14 and 15 respectively. They differed significantly on recency. 57% of Osborn/Osborn were older cites while 87% of Hanna-Gibson were. Both Gronbeck (brief) and Verderber used three references and in both cases 66% were more than ten years old.

Osborn and Osborn and the Gronbeck et. al. texts tend to ground their discussion of how-to-do persuasion in conceptual discussions of the processes of persuasion and of adversarial audiences. Hanna Gibson also provides readers elaborated discussion of persuasive process with highly developed discussions of needs (Maslow, 1954 and Packard, 1964.) Verderber's approach is highly pragmatic focusing students primarily on <u>what</u> needs to be done and <u>how</u> rather than on why. Lucas takes a third approach. His highly narrative description of how to develop a persuasive speech and tend to the needs of the audience is supplemented by reference notes that briefly allude to interesting issues related to the topic as well as to appropriate reference materials.

In addition to being different in approach, the texts are different in the kind and quality of material presented. Allen and Preiss (1990) concluded from their study of research presented in public speaking textbooks about persuasion that little uniformity exists between texts and that authors do a less than adequate job of summarizing the research.

While Allen and Preiss were primarily concerned with the use of meta-analysis as a means of assessing the quality of textbook material, the present study is more interested in describing assessing the overall nature of the material presented. Based on the results of this study, theory presented in public speaking texts can best be described as traditional. New material is frequently presented in insert boxes or special sections. Notes and reference material tend to direct students to both new studies in the field as well as to more seminal works. New theory does not seem to be fully integrated into the "thinking" of chapters reviewed.

RQ2: Do current public speaking textbooks reflect modern instructional methods?

If acquiring qualified staff to teach the public speaking course is still a major problem as reported in Gibson's two most recent surveys (1990, 1985), a pedagogically sound textbook in the hands of students becomes vital to quality instruction. Not only can a textbook compensate for inadequate instruction, but experienced teachers can use the textbook as a student resource for additional discussion of concepts. Time constraints caused by mandatory numbers of speeches and large class size make the public speaking textbook central to learning in many classrooms.

The textbooks in this study appear to be guided by clear instructional goals: learn public speaking skills incrementally, and practice each skill for mastery. Newer instructional techniques, such as case studies, problem-solving situations, role modeling, memory aids, and vibrant, often coded, color graphics, offer possibilities for immersion and reinforcement of learning. Standard tools, such as sample speeches and outlines, discussion questions, and applications exercises also appear in the textbooks. Public speaking textbooks, then, offer a variety of instructional techniques.

Patterns of instructional techniques used within the various textbooks become apparent through analysis of the introductory, informative and persuasive chapters of each. Gronbeck consistently inserts research datelines into the chapters as additional learning material intended to provoke the interest of modern students. The research topics appear well-selected: careers, televised information, and strategies, such as inoculation, forewarning, and knowledge, to resist counter-persuasive effort. Gronbeck's Brief edition, the first textbook in full color, captures the eye with

graphic design. Of the three chapters selected, however, Gronbeck (Brief) offers a research insert only in the first chapter. The standard instructional tools appear in the other two chapters, as they do in the first.

Hanna/Gibson, also in full color, reveals its approach to training for personal and professional success through the selection of preeminent persons who share their experiences with readers. George Gallup and Gloria Steinem both address anxiety, and Mario Cuomo talks about speechmaking. Quick tips are provided for both informative and persuasive speaking. A thematic, colorful geometric design flows through the textbook and binds the various sections.

Contrasted with the vibrant presentation of the aforementioned textbooks, Lucas appears traditional. His two-color scheme, green and black, are used to advantage, but lack the potency of full color. His instructional techniques vary minutely and consist of time-tested teaching aids. The assumption appears that the student must read the Lucas book, and the writing style must capture the student's interest.

Lucas appears drab when compared with Osborn's brilliant colors. State-of-the-art graphic design sets off speaker's notes sections used consistently in the three chapters. Each of these brief.lists highlight important points for students to remember.

Of all of the textbooks discussed, Verderber exhibits the most difference in number of teaching techniques used across the three chapters. The introductory chapters appears anemic when compared with the rich instructional tools used for informative and persuasive speaking. For example, case studies of professional persons sharing their speaking experience appear in the informative and persuasive chapters. However, all chapters have assignments and skills building exercises integrated with the content. Practice seems fundamental rather than supplemental to Verderber's instructional approach.

Instructional methods in current text books would appear to be up-to-date, but are they? In 1866, Hugh Blair's lectures were printed with analysis and questions provided by editor Mills. Blair's goal was to teach "eloquence" - "the art of speaking in such a manner as to attain the end of which we speak." (p. 261). Winans, in prefaces to his first and second editions, stresses practical public speaking and his goal to have students "become intelligent on the subject." (1917, p.xviii), His textbook was more than a book of thumb rules. Developing a speaker's intelligence was primary. To this end, Winans includes numerous elaborate examples, questions, sample outlines, and topic suggestions.

Very close to the goals of today's textbooks is that of Alan Monroe (1939), who says: "students learn to appreciate the values of

effective speech and to improve their own speaking." (p. xiii) Monroe also used a "functional approach to problems of speaking effectively." (1939, p. vii). His textbook introduced principles incrementally and called for explicit application of each. Found in Monroe's second edition are the following instructional techniques: pictures and charts, 30 sample speeches, extensive problem activities at the end of each chapter, annotated sample outlines, and numerous extended examples.

How different are the instructional goals and methods of Blair, Winans, and Monroe from those of current textbook authors? Analysis indicates that there are more significant similarities than differences.

Lucas (Teaching communication, 1990) confirms that "the principle of teaching skills in incremental units remains the soundest pedagogical approach, for it follows the natural process by which most people internalize knowledge and solidify skills (p. 70). Sprague (1990), in discussing the goals of communication education, asserts: "The skills rationale for education takes a special form in our discipline. We go beyond defending the practical importance of speaking, listening, discussing, debating, and relating in our students' lives. We argue that the communication skills we teach are essential to gaining other knowledge (p. 24). Cicero, Quintilian, and the authors of the textbooks under study .would offer no counter-arguments.

To return to the claim made earlier that public speaking textbooks today are more similar than different from those a half-century or a full century ago, the present analysis supports this claim. What is similar are the goals of the venerable and the new textbooks and the basic instructional tools, such as questions and exercises. What is different is the attractive, brilliant hues and graphic designs that are intended to capture the student's attention and concentration. Sometimes, colorful encapsulated information contains significant theory, and often it contains supplemental knowledge. In essence, the agenda remains unchanged, but it is played out with creativity and new printing technology.

CONCLUSION

Two general conclusions may be drawn from this study (a) despite differences in emphasis and arrangement, public speaking textbooks follow the same basic structural pattern they have for almost a century and (b) contemporary issues such as the impact of cultural diversity and media have not been integrated into the substance of the textbooks. The first conclusion is not meant to suggest that all public speaking texts are identical. Clearly, from the comparisons illustrated above, authors frequently differ in the

arrangement, amount and presentation of information on various topics. They are however, quite similar in their scope (topics covered) and pedagogy. It has also been interesting to observe how "similarity" spreads among public speaking texts. For example, the use of four color printing did not remain new and unique for very long, nor did the emphasis on the First Speech.In many ways the textbooks are much like a basic black dress that gets altered and trimmed differently according to contemporary taste and individual creative expression. Despite its different appearances, the garment remains a black dress.

The second conclusion about the lack of attention on cultural diversity and media is based on the authors' classroom experiences. Today's college students represent a greater variety of ethnic, racial and socio-economic backgrounds than ever before. To point to the chapter pages devoted to audience analysis and audience adaptation as sufficient is simply not to understand the breadth or depth of the cultural issues confronting all classroom teachers. What makes an African-American middle-income woman different from a white Hispanic upper-income man is more than gender and skin color. Learning styles, communication styles, relational styles can be different--not only from each other, but also from the teacher. Beyond the classroom, students will be communicating in intercultural contexts. Powell and Collier (1990), argue that the traditional public speaking course with its emphasis on message design and compliance-gaining strategies offers students only one way to approach communication opportunities. New conceptualizations of what's possible and what constitutes "public communication" may be in order.

There are two ways in which media concerns need to be addressed. In only one text, Gronbeck et. al, is there a focused discussion of how to speak on radio and television. These skills are becoming quite important as corporations, large and small, are making use of video tape and teleconferencing to communicate to their staffs or even to do training. If our students are to be prepared to meet the demands of the modern speaking platform, then learning how to use various mediums is important.

Haynes (1990) offers another interesting perspective, when he suggests that public speaking teachers rethink their course, taking into account the media-induced learning and attention styles of our students. He goes so far as to suggest that our current pedagogy is based on written literacy and that our culture has evolved into a "vid-oral" culture, and consequently the creation and exchange of messages will need to change.

The final point to be made here is that it is time for public speaking textbooks to change. However, the point must be made that the change will not and cannot start only with textbook authors. It is time for a renewed dialogue on the basic public speaking course. Significant change will only occur when classroom teachers

can articulate clearly what it is they want in a textbook and a course in public speaking.

References

Allen, M. and Preiss, R. W. (1990) Using Meta-Analyses to Evaluate Curriculum: An examination of Selected College Textbooks. Communication Education, 39, 103-116.

Blair, H. (1866). Lectures on rhetoric and belles lettres (A. Mills, Ed.). Philadelphia: Zell.

Bruner, M. (1990). Using the basic course to encourage international and intercultural perspectives in the curricula and within the student body. SCA convention paper.

Doolittle, R. J. (1977) Conflicting views of conflict: An analysis of basic speech communication textbooks. Communication Education. 27. 121-127.

Gibson, J., Hanna, M., & Leichty, G. (1990). The basic course at U.S. colleges and universities: V. Basic Communication Course Annual. 2, 233-257.

Gibson, J., Hanna, M., & Huddleston, B. (1985). The basic speech course at U.S. colleges and universities: IV. Communication Education, 34, 281-291.

Gibson, J., Gruner, C., Hanna, M., Smythe, M.J., & Hayes (1980). The basic course in speech at U.S. colleges and universities: III. Communication Education, 29, 2- 8.

Haynes, W.L. (1990). Public speaking pedagogy in the media age. Communication Education, 38, 89-102.

Hinchcliff-Pelias, M. (1989) Communication apprehension in basic public speaking texts: An examination of contemporary textbooks. Communication Education 38, 41-53.

Jamieson, K. (1988). Eloquence in an electronic age. NY: Oxford University Press.

Katula, R. (1990). Textbooks as an agenda setting mechanism in the basic course. SCA convention paper.

Lucas, S. (1990). Teaching public speaking. In J. Daly, G. Friedrich, & A. Vangelisti (Eds.). Teaching communication: theory, research, and methods (pp. 67-76). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Monroe, A. (1939). Principles and types of speech (rev. ed.). New York: Scott, Foresman.

Pelias, M. (1989). Communication apprehension in basic public speaking texts; an examination of contemporary textbooks. Communication Education, 38, 41-53.

Powell, R. and Collier, M.J. (1990). Public speaking instruction and cultural bias: The future of the basic course. American Behavioral Scientist, 34, 240-250.

Sprague, J. (1990). The goals of communication education. In J. Daly, G. Friedrich, & A. Vangelisti (Eds.). Teaching communication: theory, research, and methods (pp. 19-38). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Winans, J. (1917). Public speaking.(rev. ed.). New York: Century.

Wulff, D. & Nyquist, J. (1990). Instructional tools. In J. Daly, G. Friedrich, & A. Vangelisti (Eds.). Teaching communication: theory, research, and methods (pp. 249-265). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

TEXTS EVALUATED

Gronbeck, B.E., McKerrow, R.E., Ehninger, D., Monroe, A. H. (1990). Principles and Types of Speech Communication, 11th ed. Glenview, Illinois: Scott, Foresman/Little, Brown Higher Education.

Gronbeck, B.E., Ehninger, D., Monroe, A. H. (1988). Principles of Speech Communication, 10th brief ed. Glenview, Illinois: Scott, Foresman and Company.

Hanna, M.S., Gibson, J.W (1989). Public Speaking for Personal Success 2nd ed. Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown Publishers.

Lucas, S.E. (1989). The Art of Public Speaking, 3rd ed. New York: Random House.

Osborn, M. and Osborn, S. (1991). Public Speaking, 2nd ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Verderber, R. F. (1991). The Challenge of Effective Speaking 8th ed. Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth Publishing Company.

Table 1

	Osborn/Osborn	Lucas	Gronbeck et. al	Verderber	Gronbeck	Hanna/Gibson
Process	1	1	1	1	1	1
Listening	3	2	2	7	2	3
Audience Analysis	4	4	5	2	4	4
Audience Adaptation	continued	continued	8	continued		continued
Selecting Topic	5	3	4	2	3	5
Supporting Materials	6	6	7	3	5	9
Organization	7	7	9	4	6	6
Outlining	8	9	11	continued	continued	continued
Visual Aids	9	12	13	9	9	10
Information	12	13	15	8, 10, 11,12 & 13	11	12
Persuasion	13	14	16 & 6	14, 15,16	12	13
Argument	14		17	17	13	
Special Occasion	15	15	18	18	14	14
Intro. & Con.		8	10		7	7
Small Group		16		19	16	15
First Speech	2		3	1		2
Language	10	10	12	5	8	11
Delivery	11	11	14	6	10	8
Research		5				
Interviewing					15	

TABLE 2

	OSBORN & OSBORN	LUCAS	GRONBECK ET. AL.	VERDERBER	GRONBECK (BRIEF)	HANNAH & GIBSON
Objective of textbook	". . .to help students become both better speakers and better consumers of public communication."	". . .a basic text can maintain the intellectual integrity of speech-making while meeting the needs of undergrad. students; tried to show principles of public speaking."	". . .they are studying public speaking with a book that teachers both speech technique and ways of thinking about and assessing public communication in society."	". . .empowers students to meet the challenge of effective speaking in their professional and personal lives."	". . .(students will) understand the conceptual bases of communication processes; acquire a vocabulary for expertly talking about and analyzing the communicative messages of others to respond to and to help them improve."	"knowledge and skills presented in this text offer students a valuable tool that will last a lifetime."
Instructional Devices	sample anecdotal speeches & outlines learning objectives, speaker's notes, chapter summaries terms to know 12 Add'l speeches in appendix, dramatic vignettes and quotations; four color diagrams	annotated samples speeches and outlines and chapter summaries	chapter-end summaries; critical thinking exercises (problems and probes); word lists; annotated speech outlines	four-step model; fund. principles skills; practice model speeches, critiques of student speeches	Monroe formula; learn specific skills then combine them in speech; Pursuit of Excellence	Speech models of student & prof. & business speakers; objectives, previews chapters outline and summary; key terms
Theory/Practice Dichotomy	continues to offer the student both practical instruction in how to speak effectively in public and an introduction to the basic principles underlying effective communication. . .	The book continues to be informed by classical and contemporary theories of rhetoric but does not present theory for its own sake. . .	Longevity comes to textbooks that look backward and forward. . .backward to this grounding in timeless principles of speech composition and forward to new ideas that keep them ahead of the field	hierarchically arranged set of fundamental principles to guide learning and practice	Communication skills grounded in understanding, tied to a vocabulary. . .and ingrained by guided practice	blend of theory and practice
Integration of new theory	"We draw from the past and present from the social sciences and the humanities in our effort to provide the most useful coverage of the elements of public speaking for the beginning speaker.	inclusion of critical thinking. . .made sure footnote references reflect current theory and research	This textbook has prided itself on the firmness of its intellectual base, traditional rhetorical principles and contemporary communication research. communication research datelines in each chapter.	No initial statement on theory	Like its predecessors, this edition incorporates the latest thinking of scholars in rhetorical and communication theory and research.	. . .Our suggestions are based on the research literature of our field.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

	OSBORN & OSBORN	LUCAS	GRONBECK ET. AL.	VERDERBER	GRONBECK (BRIEF)	HANNAH & GIBSON
Comparison of communication model	Circular process model	Pictograph of a sphreical process model	Four-color pictographph of a communication	sid-by side wheels; connected by channels; messages in center of well spokes are fields of experience (p. 13	transaction p. 13	process model Shannon-Weaver p. 14

OSBORN 1 OSBORN LUCAS TABLE 3 VERDERBER GRONBECK (Brief) Hanna/Gibson GRONBECK

Recency of theory used in key chapters Process	Hovland Lumsdain Sheffield (1949, Rhetoric (Cooper, 1932 and Cronkhite & Liska 1976	Masterson Beebee and Watson 1983, Tubbs and Moss, 1983 and O'Keefe, 1986	Fisher, 1987 Petty and Casie, 1986, Hovland et. al., 1961, Fazio, Sanbonmastu, Powell and Kerds, 1986, Burgoon and Bettinghaus 1980, Sheriff, Sheriff and Nebergall, 1965, Beatty and Brock, 1976	Leavitt & Muller, 1951, Johannesen, 1990, Clevenger, 1959	Zimmerman Owne and Seibert, 1971, Myers and Myers, 1980, Littlejohn, 1971, Applebaum, 1973, Cronkhite, 1978, Burgoon, 1974, Knapp, 1980, Gumperz and Hymer, 1972, Collett, 1977, Shimanoff, 1980, Walter, 1966, Hart and Burks, 1972, Carlson and Eadie, 1980	Green, 1984, Schutz, 1969, Hickson and Stacks, 1985, Biggers and Masterson, 1984 and Beatty, 1981
Information	Leaker, 1981, Lowery and DeFleur, 1988, Bliss, 1967,	Byrns, 1981, Zinssen, 1985, Humes, 1976	Postman, 1985, Gronbeck, 1983, Quine and Ullian, 1970,	Haefele, 1962; Weaver, 1970 and Hennessy, 1985	Scheff et. al. 1981	Gronbeck, 1983, Bormann, 1982, Katula and Martin, 1984, Goodall and Waager, 1985
Persuasion	McQuire, 1985, Simons, 1986, Hovland Lumsdaine and Sheffield, 1949, McQuire, 1964, Anderson, 1971, McCombs, 1981, Milburn and Watson, 1981, Osborn, 1986, Wicklund, 1976, Brehm, 1976, Wallace, 1965, Fisher, 1978, Monroe, 1935	Simons, 1986, Littlejohn and Jabush, 1987, Bettinghaus and Cody, 1987, Dillard, Hunter and Burgoon, 1984, Claldini, 1984, Leventhal Singer and Jones, 1965, Bosten and Mongeau, 1984, Beck and Frankel, 1981, Clark, 1984, Ehninger, Gronbeck McKerrow and Monroe, 1986, Benn, 1978 Hovland Lumsdain and Sheffield, 1949, Smith, 1982, Miller, Burgoon and Burgoon, 1982, McCroskey and Young, 1981, Petty and Cacioppo, 1981, McCroskey, 1982, Wheeless, 1973, Weiss, 1975, Hemple, 1979, Reynolds and Burgoon, 1983 Perloff and Brock, 1980 Kline, 1989, Stiff, 1984, Petty, et. al. 1987 Morely	Fisher, 1987, Petty and Cacioppo, 1986, Hovland,et. al. 1961, Deaux and Wrightsman, 1988, Rokeach, 1968, Prescott, 1975 Fazio and Williams, 1984, Fazio et. al. 1986, Abelson, 1968, , Burgoon and Bettinghaus, 1980, Deaux and Wrightman 1988, Sheriff, Sheriff and Nebergall, 1965, Kelley, 1965 Newcomb, 1965, Mackie, 1987, Petty and Brock, 1976, Littlejohn, 1972, Liska, 1978, Perelman and Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969, Fisher, 1984, Morley and Walker, 1987, Morely, 1987, Miller, et. al. 1984, Tetlock, 1984, Tetlock, 1986, Gronbeck, 1983	Deux and Wrightsman, 1988, Weaver, 1970, Anderson and Clevenger, 1973	Maslow 1954/70, Zimbardo, 1985, Dewey, 1910	Schwatz and Rycenga, 1965, Thonssen, 1948, Robets and Cooper, 1954, Rank, 1976, Packard, 1964, Maslow, 1954, Adams, 1976, Monroe, 1935, McCroskey and Young, 1981, Zimbardo Ebbesen and Maslock, 1977

Table 4

	Gronbeck	Gronbeck (brief)	Hanna/ Gibson	Lucas	Osborn & Osborn	Verderber
Introduction	*pictures of speakers of different cultures *Research Dateline (boxes insert on Communication Careers *transactional model graphic *key terms *problems and probes *communication activities	*2 classroom examples *In Pursuit of Excellence (insert) Shyness research *transactional model graphic *oral activities	*outline *objectives *quotation *process model graphic *anxiety insert (boxed) by George Gallup, Jr. *key terms *discussion questions with suggestions	*picture *outline *process model graphic *review questions *application exercises	*picture *quotation *goals *Speaker's Notes (boxed) on plagiarism *Speaker's Notes (boxed) on creating a speech *types of speeches figure *terms to know *discussion questions *application exercises	*pictures of formal and informal speaking situations *process model graphic *sample outline *narrative speech assignment *sample student speech
Information	*Research Dateline (boxed) on Televised Information *4 sample outlines *key terms *problems and probes *communication activities	*4 sample outlines *classroom example *sample speech *oral activities	*Outline *objectives *quotation *Anxiety insert (boxed) by Gloria Steinem *common types of topics (table) *key terms *discussion questions	*picture *outline *sample speech (annotated) *review questions *application exercises	*picture *quote *Speaker's Notes (boxed): keeping attention/interest Speaker's notes (boxed): design *terms *discussion questions *application exercises *sample speech annotated	*pictures of informative speech setting *preview of informative speaking *case study of accountant: Making complex information relevant *5 principles (boxed) **speech evaluation form *speech evaluation assignment *sample outline *sample speech (annotate *separate chapters on demonstration, description,definition and reporting follow same formats as above *Interview questions (boxed) in reporting chapter

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

	Gronbeck	Gronbeck (Brief)	Hanna/Gibson	Lucas	Osborn and Osborn	Verderber
Persuasion	*Research Dateline (boxed) on Strategies to Resist Counter-Persuasion *2 sample outlines *sample speech (annotated *key terms *problems and probes *communication activities	*2 classroom examples *Maslow's hierarchy graphic *advertisement graphic *Motivated sequence graphic *3 sample outlines *oral activities	*outline *objectives *quotation *Maslow's hierarch graphic *Speech-making insert (boxed) by Mario Cuomo *ten tips (table) *key terms *discussion questions	*Picture *outline *sample speech (annotated) *review questions *application exercises	*picture *quote *goals *Speaker's Notes: McGuire's model 3 Speaker's Notes audience *Speaker's Notes: design *Types of speeches and designs figure *terms *discussion questions *application exercises *sample speech (annotated	*preview of persuasive speaking *case study of teacher: communicating from the heart *seven principles (boxed) *skills development exercises: goals, audience, attitudes, reasons, organization, emotional appeals, speech evaluation form *speech assignment *sample outline *sample speech (annotated)